Local Market Economics: Brand Analysis in the Market

Syed Raza Abbas*  
Muhammad Zia-ur-Rehman†  
Salma Khan‡

p-ISSN: 2521-2974 | e-ISSN: 2707-0093 | L-ISSN: 2521-2974
DOI: 10.31703/ger.2016(I-I).04

Abstract

The purpose of the study was to provide an overview of the present situation of the Colgate toothpaste brand in comparison with other brands on the market such as Forhans, Macleans, and others. The trust for the brand in the market provides an opportunity to examine different theoretical and practical propositions. In this research Customers segmental differences in the use of intrinsic and extrinsic product cues (physical quality, design, brand name, and price) on consumers’ evaluations and purchase intentions for an apparel product in Karachi market are investigated. Our findings revealed that design, brand, taste, flavor, performance, promotion were product attributes that impact product evaluations and marketing position. However, design, brand name, and performance were the main factors in attracting the customers.

Key Words: Economic Growth, Life Expectancy, Infant Mortality

JEL Classification: L14.

Introduction

There are many factors that control human health such as diet, environment, education, physical training, housekeeping, physical care, routine medical check-up and personal hygiene. One of the most important factors which affects human health, is cleaning of teeth and prevention of scale deposits on teeth. Clean and healthy teeth diminish chances of many periodontal diseases such as gum disease, bleeding gum, bacteria gum, gingivitis, etc. It is history, which tells us that in old age or the stone era people took care of their teeth by using different methods/techniques. Miswak may be quoted as one of the old sources which are still being used in Pakistan especially in rural areas. The use of Miswak or neem tree twigs are common in the subcontinent and the Middle East. Nowadays, the old practices of cleaning teeth are either reduced or totally abandoned in some areas, communities, and segments of users.

Background

* Independent Research Fellow, Islamabad
† Assistant Professor, National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.
Email: drziaemail@gmail.com
‡ Office Assistant, Bacha Khan University, Charssada, KP, Pakistan.
It was a general observation or problem that many families and individuals used a single toothpaste brand for a long time without a shift to another toothpaste brand. The shift from one brand to another brand was noted in rare cases of compulsion only. The reason for adherence to one toothpaste brand was a necessary investigation so I choose one of the popular toothpastes, the Colgate Brand for research and study.

The significance of “Comparison of Colgate With Other Toothpaste Brands of the Market” would reflect the actual market level of each toothpaste brand. Secondly, the dealer would come to know their market standing from the perspective of the end-user’s point of view for the formulation of their future sale strategy. The third point was to persuade customers to improve their trends, habits, and preferences and not to adopt things and matters as routine. They should decide their matters on merit only (Hans, Laser 2003).

Therefore, to dig out the facts it became essential to study the market and conduct a market search. The major objective of this project was to assess the satisfaction level of customers of the Colgate toothpaste brand and its competitors such as Forhans, Macleans, and Signal -2/another toothpaste brand available in the market.

The aim of this search was
i) To evaluate the market position of the Colgate toothpaste brand from the perspective of ultimate users.
ii) To compare the Colgate toothpaste brand with Forhan, Macleans, Signal -2 /other brands of the market.
iii) To investigate/dig out the weakness and strength of the Colgate Brand and to elaborate them.
iv) To give suggestions for improvement of the Colgate toothpaste brand in the light of analysis.

And the following objectives were attained
- Made face to face contact with customers and conducted interviews
- Provided structured questionnaires to 161 individuals including 11 sellers and got them filled in.
- Analyzed the data collected and concluded the results.
- Recommendations for increasing Colgate Market level

Literature Review

The technique of tooth brushing by using toothpaste is very familiar in the current era. The performance of brushing mostly depends upon the quality of toothpaste and it’s selection by customers. Most people look for good flavor, thickness (neither too runny nor too hard) and pleasant texture of toothpaste. People also want the mouth to feel clean after brushing, with sweet breath, and for teeth to look not only unstained but as white as possible.

Quite a few dentists recommend avoiding tartar-control toothpaste since they can contribute to oral problems. In most mouths, tartar only builds up if plaque is left on the teeth for a longer period, so as long as you brush often enough with a fluoride toothpaste to control plaque, tartar should not accumulate.

Dentists, on the other hand, say the best toothpaste is the one that protects teeth from cavities, softened enamel, and plaque. If not removed at least every 24 hours, plaque hardens into tartar, which builds up and makes teeth and gums even more susceptible to decay - resulting in a negative cycle that can cause first gingivitis, then serious periodontal
disease. In turn, quite a few experts believe that periodontal disease may cause systemic problems, including heart problems. So, to avoid above medical problems the selection of toothpaste brand is an important issue as every toothpaste company has the challenge of controlling teeth problems and giving better results. In fact, the result depends on the quality, which is defined by ingredients. The different toothpaste brands have different ingredient composition whose performance may be assessed through comments of end-users and dentists. The other factor involved in selecting a toothpaste brand are the 4Ps (product, price, place, and promotion). All companies praise their own product. This challenge can only be confirmed by measuring their output, adopting standard procedures and applying appropriate tools to measure attributes of each toothpaste brand from end-users and dealers responses.

The research included sources of primary and secondary information. Conducting face-to-face interviews and putting questionnaires before customers and dealers collected primary information. About 161 individuals took part in this exercise and filled in the required format as attached in appendices A, B and C. Mostly the questions which were asked from customers were regarding marketing and especially attributes of Colgate, Forhans, Macleans and Signal -2 or other brands of toothpaste available in the market. The area selected for research was Karachi due to many reasons as explained below;

- That I was residing in Karachi.
- That it was the largest market in the country.
- That it was the biggest city of Pakistan, which represented the whole of Pakistan as people from all the four provinces and Azad Kashmir including their rural and urban areas live here.

Therefore, the responses received from customers who used toothpaste would have better weight. For convenience, Karachi was further divided into four sectors i.e. A, B, C, and D.

Looking into the nature of the project for the collection of primary data it became essential to have face to face contact because no other sources such as telephone, e-mail, and post, etc. would prove successful as people did not have interest in such investigations.

Generally, good companies conduct a market survey before launching a new product, which is not our subject. As far as our topic and research about the comparison of toothpaste brands are concerned was investigated from the perspective of customers and ultimate users. The required information was gathered from customers and market dealers.

In the research, emphases were given from the perspective of customer’s belief, trust and behavior towards the product, brand, positioning, and promotion of the Colgate Brand and its competitors namely Forhans, Macleans, Signal -2 and other brands available in the market.

One of the most important factors is quality in this connection, and companies strongly need to focus on building the quality of their products and services. According to Chaudhuri et al (2000), commercials and advertisements should focus more on showing quality instead of having a lot of information crammed into the commercial space. Brands that offer their consumers good quality as well as good value gain their consumer’s trust and have a long life cycle. Furthermore, the more trusted the brand the more of a chance it has to compete in an international market composed of different nationalities.

**Methodology and Analysis**

A population can be defined as including all people or items with the characteristic one
wishes to understand, and the terminology “Sampling” indicates the selection of a part of a group or an aggregate with a view to obtaining information about the whole. Thus, the aggregate or totality of all members is known as the Population although they need not be human beings as stated in research Methodology for Marketing decision Course Design and Management Team, [2004] Research Methodology for Management Decision A.I.O.U Islamabad.

The population of the project belonged to different socio-economic and demographic backgrounds living in Karachi. This population was a mix of students, schoolteachers, and professors. Doctors, engineers, managers, businessmen, retailers/distributors, the general public, housewives, landlords, bankers, retired officers/employees, etc. The people who were not a user of toothpaste were excluded from our research work whereas the actual size of the population was not known.

The samples of the population were selected on a Simple Random basis from all four sectors A, B, C and D framed for this purpose. The size of the sample consisted of 161 respondents/individuals including 11 sellers/dealers approximately.

In this case, toothpaste brands were the unit of analysis whose characteristics were measured.

The questionnaires, face to face contact or personal interviews comprised the best method for collecting primary data because it had advantages over other methods and because it was the most flexible method for obtaining primary data, identification of respondents was known, nonresponse very low and we were able to collect maximum information. For the collection of data self, my knowledgeable persons and I were engaged which was easily done. This assignment processed by face to face contact, conducting interviews and duly filled in questionnaires A, B, and C for Customers/end users, based on an object or unit attributes and dealers respectively.

The data which was collected primarily was arranged, coded, and analyzed either manually or using Microsoft Excel as a tool.

The parametric data were collected through primary sources processed and arranged for a quantitative analysis basis by using manual and Microsoft Excel techniques.

**Qualitative Data Analysis**

Semantic Differential Scale Method: the individual customers rated the Toothpaste brand object or concept. This type of attitude measurement is called Semantic differential scale. The Semantic Differential Scale is based on a seven-point rating /scaling of each item attribute and defined extreme positions. The customers of different groups and segments were asked to allocate rank to each item attribute related to toothpaste brand product, taste, availability, feeling of freshness, packing, performance, prevention of teeth decay. During analysis the positive phrases were kept on the right side and negative on left.

The image profile was based on the scores of each respondent on every dimension and the average score for all respondents’ overall image ratings. The maximum and minimum score given to each item were between (-21) to (+21) base on 7-point scale measurement as referred in Course Design and Management Team, [2004] Research Methodology for Management Decision A.I.O.U Islamabad page 107. This ranking reflects whether the respondents had favorable attitudes in support of Colgate Brand or had a preference for other brands such as Forhans, Macleans, and Signal-2, etc.
The samples were selected from the Population, which was divided into four Sectors of Karachi. Then interviews were conducted from 150 individuals/customers and 11 dealers as mentioned in different formats, which were duly filled in by the respondents. Each question given in the questionnaires was analyzed individually. The analysis is given below;

**Use of Toothpaste by Customers**

Out of 150 customers use of toothpaste sector-wise is A 20 %, B 28 %, C and D 22 %

**Use of different Brands of Toothpaste by Customers.**

Customers using Colgate Brand in all Sectors is 76(50.67%); Customers using Forhans Brand in all sectors is 24(16%); Customers using Macleans Brand in all sectors is 32(21%); Customers using Signal -2/other Brands in all sectors is 18(12%)

![Graph 1: Use of Different Brands of Toothpaste by Customers of Sector A, B, C & D](image)

**Age-wise Quantitative Data Analysis**

The age group of the respondents was identified and the association of toothpaste brands with the age of the customers was established, showing the Colgate brand was preferred among respondents;

![Graph 2: Different Brands of Toothpaste Used by Different Age Group Customers](image)
Graph 3: Colgate Brand Toothpaste Used by Different Age Groups.

Quantitative Data Analysis for Different Professionals and Categories of Customers Using Different Brands of Tooth Paste:

The respondents were also categorized based on the use of a preferred brand of toothpaste by different professionals and customers and the data was analyzed for each category mentioned below,

Graph 4: Colgate Brand Toothpaste Used by Different Age Groups

Different Professionals and Categories of Customers Using Different Brands of Toothpaste

Qualitative Data Analysis According to Questionnaire-B

Qualitative analysis of toothpaste brand on the basis of attributes- Semantic Differential Scale/Average Rating
Service Personal
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 9.33
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) 1.79
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 5.49
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 1.63

Educationists
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 8.3
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) 5.4
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 4.0
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 0

Doctor & Pharmacists
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 7.72
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) 2.67
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 5.28
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 1.67

Students
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 7.87
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) – 1.69
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 7.04
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 5.67

Housewives
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 8.8
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) 5.75
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 10
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 3.67

Sectors ‘A, B, C D including the business community
Colgate awarded Rank (Score) 7.84
Forhans awarded Rank (Score) 2.94
Macleans awarded Rank (Score) 6.23
Signal-2/Other awarded Rank (Score) 2.31

Quantitative & Qualitative Data Analysis According to Questionnaire-C
Ranks are given by Dealers to different brands of toothpaste
The ranking of different toothpaste brands is calculated on two different bases firstly on the simple average score of attributes awarded by dealers and secondly on semantic method as briefed under:

1) Ranking on Semantic Method
   Brand   Rank
   Colgate  1.844
   Forhans  1.519
Result-oriented Analysis

The data were analyzed through responses based on different attributes of all the toothpaste brands namely Colgate, Forhans, Macleans and Signal-2/Other Brands. The attributes which accounted for were taste, smell, packing, tube design, paste color, performance, prevention of teeth decay/scaling, feeling of freshness after brushing, price and availability of stock in the market.

The mean, median and standard deviation were calculated based on responses of the population about different attributes as mentioned in the item above for all the toothpaste Brands namely Colgate, Forhans, Macleans and Signal-2/Other Brands. 

The data was analyzed and the following results were reflected based on the responses of the population about the different attributes of Colgate, Forhans, Macleans and Signal-2/Other brands.

Discussing the results of the analysis, we find that:

- The maximum use of the Colgate toothpaste brand was seen in the age group of 25 to 34 years which was about 33.33% of total customers of toothpaste. Customers of the age group were young with good health and financially stable/normal or in other words, they have fewer liabilities in life. In this age group consumption of Colgate Brand was also noted highest one as 64 % amongst all the brands which reflects faith and belief of users in Colgate Brand.

- The minimum use of the Colgate toothpaste brand was observed by the age group of 45-54 years which was 2% of total consumers of toothpaste. But it was also an observation that the use of toothpaste consumption decreased in this age group. The observation reflects that the consumer’s behavior changed due to any reason and shifted to other substitutes/options such as oral or medicinal methods. One of the...
reasons for the shift was suspected as the sensitiveness of the teeth or development of cavities etc.

- No consumer either affected by dental diseases or having allergies used the Colgate toothpaste brand. The proportion of consumption of Colgate, Forhans, Macleans and Signal-2/Other Brands was 0: 16:1 and 0 respectively. Subsequently, it assumed that no customer had confidence in Colgate Brand while he was ill.
- The overall proportion of the population using the Colgate Brand, Forhans Brand, Macleans Brand, and other brands was 76 : 24: 32: and 18 or (50.7 %, 16 %, 21.3%, and 12%). This proportion showed good standing of Colgate Brand.
- The maximum consumption of the Colgate toothpaste brand was recorded in the profession of Doctors and Pharmacists which was about 63 % amongst the user of Colgate Brand. It was a good sign and reflected a good image of Colgate Brand amongst the competitors.
- The toothpaste characteristics (4 Ps) such as the taste, smell, color, performance, instinct performance and teeth scaling prevention property were scored as 35.33, 47.33 %, 47.33%, 45.33 %, 22.67%, and 33.33% respectively by users of the Colgate toothpaste brand.
- Consumers of Colgate Brand product declared 1.33% (2) cheap, 40.67 % (61) normal and 6.67% (10) costly whereas 3.33% (5) did not respond. The results are far better than its nearest competitor Macleans Brand.
- 9 customers of Colgate Brand are not satisfied with the quality, 4 consumers are not satisfied with the packing of the brand. 9 consumers are not satisfied with the marketing of the brand. 4 consumers are not satisfied with the price set up of the brand. As compared to other brands the defects noted are proportionally high.
- 17 customers of Colgate Brand asked to improve quality, 31 to decrease cost and 13 to give incentives to consumers. The demand to provide facilities are higher than other competitors.

Qualitative Analysis

The ranking awarded to different Brands of toothpaste on the basis of attributes (Semantic Scale) indicated as under:

- Rank given by all customers of Sector A, B, C, D, and business community were Colgate Brand 7.84, Forhans 2.94, MaCleans 6.23 and Signal -2 or others 2.31
- Rank given by all customers of Sector A, B, C, D excluding business community were Colgate Brand 7.66, Forhans 2.65, Macleans 6.06 and Signal -2 or others 1.38.
- Rank given by all customers of Sector A to Colgate Brand 9.66, Forhans 0.3, Macleans 6.9 and Signal -2 or others 0.6. The score awarded to Colgate Brand is the maximum amongst sectors.
- Rank given by all customers of Sector ‘D’ were Colgate Brand – 0.36, Forhans 3.3, Macleans 6.3 and Signal -2/others 4.03. If the results were examined properly it was revealed that the residents of Sector ‘D’ which composed of Defence, Clifton, Saddar, and Kachi Abadies, etc included a significant number of the elite class who was very much sensitive and health caring. They always impressed by the propaganda both positive and negative. It was suspected that they were affected by the “The Buzz” the issue with fluoride, Triclosan and sodium lauryl sulfate which
causes bone cancer and other diseases but there was not much evidence to support. But on the contrary during the investigation, we noted remarks of some customers that they don’t use Colgate because it’s used gave irritation to gum/skin.

- Rank given by all customers of Civil Service Personal for Colgate Brand 9.33, Forhans 1.79, Macleans 5.49 and Signal -2/Others 1.63 were noted.
- The Rank given by Housewives to Colgate Brand /Forhans, Macleans and Signal-2 Brands are 8.8, 5.75, 10 and 3.67 respectively. In this cadre, Colgate Brand is lagging behind Macleans Brand.

Conclusion and Recommendation

The results based on individual attributes scored by customers reflected that the Colgate toothpaste brand availability was ranked more than 7 which was highest from all competitors whereas the lowest rank was awarded to the price which was above 4. All the individual attributes of the Colgate toothpaste brand were higher than the rank awarded to Forhan Brand, Macleans, and Signal -2/Other Brands of Market. The average ranks of Colgate Brand, ForhansBrand, Macleans, and other brands were 0.597, 0.248, 0.489 and 0.053 respectively. The results were encouraging for Colgate Brand as a major portion of the market was supported by the customers of Colgate Brand.

Colgate Brand needed improvement in its quality / composition of ingredients so that all consumer who was affected by an allergy or dental disease might attract. Awareness about Colgate Product should have increased, and the anti “BUZZ” campaign be launched in Sector “D” of Karachi. Colgate Brand authority should consider the recommendation of customers for further sales improvement of by revising the cost of the product, improving quality and introducing another incentive such as complimentary gift scheme, etc. There is a need to work on women cadre where Colgate is lagging behind the Macleans Brand.
References


